PATRICK K.WONG Corporation Counsel

EDWARD S. KUSHI First Deputy

LYDIA A. TODA Risk Management Officer Tel. No. (808) 270-7535 Fax No. (808) 244-2646

DEPARTMENT OF THE CORPORATION COUNSEL COUNTY OF MAUI 200 SOUTH HIGH STREET, 3RD FLOOR WAILUKU, MAUI, HAWAII 96793

EMAIL: CORPCOUN@MAUICOUNTY.GOV TELEPHONE: (808) 270-7740 FACSIMILE: (808) 270-7152

July 2, 2013

MEMO TO: G. Riki Hokama, Chair

Policy Intergovernmental Affairs Committee

F R O M: Moana M. Lutey, Deputy Corporation Counsel (

SUBJECT: Litigation Matters (PIA-1)

Claim of Piilani Gardens, LLC, Claim No. 2012-011

Our Department respectfully requests the opportunity to discuss the settlement of the above-referenced claim. There is no urgency in the scheduling of this matter.

It is anticipated that an executive session may be necessary to discuss questions and issues pertaining to the powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities of the County, the Council, and the Committee.

Copies of the claim and the proposed resolution are enclosed. Our department would also like to request that a representative of the Department of Environmental Management be present at the meeting to answer any questions that may arise.

Thank you for your anticipated assistance

MML:ma Enclosures

cc: Kyle Ginoza, Director of Environmental Management

Resolution

No.	

AUTHORIZING SETTLEMENT OF CLAIM NO. 2012-011 OF PIILANI GARDENS, LLC

WHEREAS, Piilani Gardens, LLC filed Claim No. 2012-011 on December 28, 2011, against the County of Maui for damages allegedly caused by the presence of plastic debris in their irrigation system from reclaimed water on or about September 2011; and

WHEREAS, the County of Maui and Piilani Gardens, LLC, to avoid incurring expenses and the uncertainty of a judicial determination of the parties' respective rights and liabilities, have reached a proposed resolution of this claim by way of a negotiated settlement; and

WHEREAS, having reviewed the facts and circumstances regarding this matter and being advised of attempts to reach resolution of this claim by way of a negotiated settlement by the Department of the Corporation Counsel, the Council wishes to authorize settlement; now, therefore,

BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the County of Maui:

- That payment is authorized to satisfy settlement of this claim following the execution of the "Release of Claim" by Piilani Gardens, LLC; and
 - 2. That certified copies of this Resolution be transmitted

Resolution	No.	

to the Mayor, the Director of Finance, the Director of Environmental Management, and the Corporation Counsel.

APPROVED AS TO FORM AND LEGALITY:

IOANA M./ LUTEY 🗡

peputy qorppratqon Counsel

County of Maui

 $S: \texttt{\sc NML\claims\claims\claims\sc Silva,\ Marilyn\claims\cla$



OFFICE OF THE COUNTY CLERK

COUNTY OF MAUI 200 SOUTH HIGH STREET WAILUKU, MAUI, HAWAII 96793 www.mauicounty.gov/county/clerk



December 28, 2011

John Mullen & Company 677 Ala Moana Boulevard, Suite 910 Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Attn: Arlene Laufasa

New Claims Assignment

Dear Ms. Laufasa:

Respectfully transmitted is a copy of a claim against the County of Maui filed by Marilyn Silva, Managing Member of Piilani Gardens LLC, 150 Manino Circle, Kihei, which was received by our office on December 28, 2011.

Very truly yours,

JEFFREY T. KUWADA

County Clerk

Attachment

CC:

Mayor

Corporation Counsel

Council Chair

Department of Finance Director of Public Works

COUNTY OF MAUI

RECEIVED

CLAIM FOR DAMAGE OR INJURY

2011 DEC 28 PM 2: 04

PL 1	Claimant: Mr. Mrs. Ms. PII ANI GARDENS, COUNTY CLERK
1.	Address: 150 MANINO CIRCLE KILEL MANINO CIRCLE
	•
3.	Telephone No.: Business 808-874/800 Residence
4.	Date of Accident: N/A Location of Accident: Property Same as Claims Property Damage \$ 21, 797.12 Personal Injury \$
5.	Location of Accident: Vioperty Same as Claumant
6.	Amount of Claim: Property Damage \$ 21, 791.12 Personal Injury \$
7.	Describe the accident in detail. Indicate all the facts, causes, persons involved, witnesses, extent of damage, etc., and why you think the County is responsible. You may write on the back if needed.
	see affacted
8.	
8.	If you carry insurance applicable to this claim, please provide the name and address of the insurance company and your policy number.
8.	company and your policy number.
8.	company and your policy number.
8.	company and your policy number. Policy No.
8.	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company? If yes, amount claimed \$ Deductible amount \$
8.	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company?
8.	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company? If yes, amount claimed \$ Deductible amount \$
8.	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company? If yes, amount claimed \$ Deductible amount \$
	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company? If yes, amount claimed \$ Deductible amount \$
	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company? If yes, amount claimed \$ Deductible amount \$ B. If a claim was filed with your insurance company, what action do they intend to take?
	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company? If yes, amount claimed \$
	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company? If yes, amount claimed \$
	Policy No. A. Did you file a claim with your insurance company? If yes, amount claimed \$ Deductible amount \$ B. If a claim was filed with your insurance company, what action do they intend to take?



150 Manino Circle, Kihei, HI. 96753 808-874-1800 Fax 874-1426

To Whom It May Concern,

As discussed previously we are requesting assistance and reimbursement of the retrofit to our irrigation system at Piilani Garden Apartments according to Chapter 20-30.080 (Cost to Retrofit).

Attached are the costs associated with the retrofit due to the use of contaminated reclaimed water and the loss of plants due to the mal functioning of our irrigation equipment also caused by this reclaimed water.

Thanking you in advance for your help and consideration.

Marilyn Silva

from: Piilani Garden Apartments 150 Manino Circle Kihei, Hi 96753

to: Maui County Dept. of Water Services

re: use of reclaimed water

Dear Sirs:

Over the past several years the irrigation system at Piilani Garden begin to experience severe problems. The landscape labourers were constantly changing nozzles as existing nozzles and filters would stop working due to debris in the sprinklers. Rotors also experienced problems due to debris buildup. And pressure to heads was much less than at the beginning, not due to lack of pressure at the meter, but build up of thick 'plaque' inside all main and lateral lines. In addition, the drip lines to planters around the apartments would stop working, and then emitters would blow out when a sufficient number we plugged. Weep lines under lawn areas also stopped working. The vigor of the property went down.

On a phone call to the waste water division we were informed that properties had experienced similiar problems with the reclaimed water. It was revealed that the department was understaffed and the screens and storage tanks were not cleaned and in fact needed repairs. Also that after September 1st things were going to improve.

When we installed our own filter it was amazing the amount of plastic and paper debris that was coming onto our property. We now clean the main filter on a weekly basis. Also, the new drip filters are collecting a large amount of fine sand that the main filter cannot get. It is little wonder that the many rotors on property stopped working as the

insides were scoured with that sand until the friction increased and they stopped working prematurely. Solenioids and valves were adversely affected as well.

The costs we present are over and above what would be considered normal maintenance wear and tear.

It is our understanding that the costs associated with retrofitting the property to deal with this very 'dirty water' can be reimbursed through a reduced water rate over a period of time. We are requesting that compensation at this time.

Steve Snow Landscaping Supervisor